



THE KNESSET



Research &  
Information  
Center

# Appropriate Representation in the Civil Service: Arab Society

Written By: Amir Prager | Approved by: Orly Almagor-Lotan, Team Leader

Date: August 4th 2020—14 Av 5780

Overview

## Summary

This document was written for the Constitution, Law and Justice Committee headed by Knesset Member Yakov Asher, and it presents data regarding the rate at which the Arab population is represented in the civil service. The first part of this document discusses Arab employees in the civil service, the second part addresses the recruitment of members of the Arab population to the civil service, and the third part discusses the representation of Arabs in management training programs in the civil service. Some of the data presented in this document were taken from the 2019 Diversifying the Civil Service Report, which was published this past May by the Civil Service Commission; others were provided by the Civil Service Commission at the request of the Knesset Research and Information Center. Note that data regarding the Arab population also includes the Druze and Circassian populations.

**The Civil Service (Appointments) Law, 1959 stipulates that the civil service must ensure the appropriate representation of several population groups—including Arabs—at every rank, in every profession, and in all ministries and auxiliary units. In November 2007, the Government adopted a resolution that at least 10% of civil servants would come from the Arab population by the end of 2012.** The goal of this decision was to bring the level of the representation of Arabs among civil servants (at the time, approximately 6%) closer to their level among the general population (approximately 20%). **The goal has not been updated since then.**

According to the Civil Service Commission, **in 2019, members of the Arab population comprised 12.2% of civil servants;** i.e., their level of representation had increased by six percentage points since 2007, when, as mentioned above, it was 6%. **However,** an examination of the percentage of Arabs employed in Government ministries found that **in only three of the 22 Government ministries (Interior, Health, Labor and Welfare) did Arabs comprise at least 10% of the employees.**

The distribution of Arab employees between the system of Government ministries and the healthcare system differs from that of civil servants in general: **in 2019, two-thirds of Arabs employed in the civil service were employed by the healthcare system,** as compared to 45% of all civil servants.

In 2019, 7.7% of the employees in the Government ministries system were Arabs. More than half of the Arab employees in the Government ministries were employed in the professional grades. The grades with a particularly high percentage of Arab employees were inspectors in the Ministry of Education (17%–18%), teachers (15%), and social workers (14%).

**In 2019, 18% of the employees in the healthcare system were Arabs, of whom 85% were employed in the professional grades.** The grades with a particularly high percentage of Arab employees were public health nurses (30%), x-ray technicians (27%), and doctors (25%).

An evaluation of civil service recruitment data revealed that **members of the Arab population submitted 11% of the candidacies for public tenders published by the Civil Service Commission in 2019, and 12% of those selected through these tenders were Arabs.** In tenders for senior positions, Arabs submitted 7% of the candidacies, and the ratio of Arabs selected was also 7% (two out of 29).

**Some 60% of the designated personnel recruitment tenders published in 2019 were intended for the Arab population.** An average of 21 candidates applied for each tender. The rate of Arab candidates who possessed the minimum qualifications for the positions (46%) was lower than the rate among candidates from other protected classes, except for the ultra-Orthodox, in designated tenders, and lower even than the rate among all the candidates for non-designated tenders. The percentage of the tenders designated for the Arab population in which a candidate was selected at the end of the screening procedures (38%) was lower than in tenders designated for the ultra-Orthodox and lower even than the rate in non-designated tenders in which a candidate was selected. However, this latter rate was higher than that for tenders designated for people with disabilities or for Ethiopians.

**The civil service has several management training programs. Between 2012 and 2018, the Civil Service Cadet Program, which is intended for people from outside the civil service, had ten Arab cadets, or 5% of the program participants.** The rate of Arab participants in management training programs for mid- and senior-level civil servants—the Senior Staff Reserves Program and the Senior Staff Fellows Program—is 9.4% and 6.3%, respectively; these rates are higher than the rate of Arabs in the target populations of these programs, mid- and senior-level civil servants.

## 1. Background

Section 15A of the Civil Service (Appointments) Law, 5719-1959 (hereinafter, "the Civil Service Law") includes a **mandate to ensure the appropriate representation of certain population groups at all ranks, in every profession, and in every ministry and auxiliary unit. As of late 2000, the list of these population groups includes Arabs (including Druze and Circassians).**<sup>1</sup>

The Civil Service Law includes a mandate to ensure the appropriate representation of certain population groups at all ranks, in every profession, and in every ministry and auxiliary unit

<sup>1</sup> [Civil Service \(Appointments\) Law, 1959](#), Section 15A [Hebrew].

The law did not set numerical goals for realizing the appropriate representation requirement. **In November 2007, the Government adopted a resolution according to which Arabs would comprise at least 10% of the civil servants by the end of 2012.** To that end, each Government ministry and auxiliary unit was required to formulate a work plan, in coordination with the Civil Service Commission, to promote the appropriate representation of the Arab population among its employees. Each plan would set forth the number of employees from this population to be taken on in the relevant timeframe and the positions to be designated for them.<sup>2</sup> In January and March 2009, the Government adopted additional resolutions, which set forth measures for implementing this goal and removing obstacles to the induction of Arab employees into civil service. These steps included adding designated positions, increasing the accessibility of information regarding designated positions, shortening the time needed for staffing, establishing a pool of members of hiring committees from among the protected groups, and preparing a ministerial mentoring framework for all new employees.<sup>3</sup> The explanatory notes to the January 2009 resolution stated that its objective was to reduce the gap between the rate of Arabs among civil servants (at the time, approximately 6%) and their level among the general population (approximately 20%).<sup>4</sup> **Since November 2007, the mandatory rate of Arabs in the civil service has not been updated.** This document presents data regarding the representation of Arabs (including Druze and Circassians) in the civil service, which were received from the Employment Diversity Division and the Department of Tenders and Exams in the Civil Service Commission, as well as additional data from the 2019 Diversifying the Civil Service Report published last May by the Civil Service Commission.<sup>5</sup> We note that the data published by the Civil Service Commission do not include information regarding employees in the Israeli defense

**In November 2007, the Government adopted a resolution according to which Arabs would comprise at least 10% of the civil servants by the end of 2012. The goal has not been updated since then**

---

<sup>2</sup> Resolution 2579 of the 31st Government, [Appropriate representation of the Arab, Druze and Circassian populations in the civil service](#), November 11<sup>th</sup> 2007 [Hebrew].

<sup>3</sup> Resolution 4436 of the 31st Government, [Appropriate representation of members of the Arab, Druze and Circassian populations in the civil service—Approval of recommendations by an inter-ministerial team](#), January 25<sup>th</sup> 2009 [Hebrew]; Resolution 4450 of the 31st Government [Appropriate representation of members of the Arab, Druze and Circassian populations in the civil service—Enforcement](#), March 15<sup>th</sup> 2009 [Hebrew]

<sup>4</sup> Prime Minister's Office, [Proposed resolution—Appropriate representation of the Arab, Druze and Circassian population in the civil service—Approval of recommendations of an inter-ministerial team](#), January 21<sup>st</sup> 2009 [Hebrew].

<sup>5</sup> Civil Service Commission, Employment Diversity Division, [Diversifying the civil service: Diversity and representation report in the civil service for the year 5778–5779, 2019](#), May 2020 [Hebrew].

establishment. In addition, we note that membership in a group that is protected for the purposes of the civil service is based on a voluntary statement made by the civil servant.<sup>6</sup> Thus, it is possible that not all the employees who are members of protected groups are registered as such in the Civil Service Commission data.

The civil service can be divided into three organizational systems: the system of Government ministries and auxiliary units (hereinafter: the Government ministries system), the healthcare system, and the Israeli defense establishment. The sections below will present the main points regarding the representation of Arabs. Each relevant chapter has a link to detailed data on the subject, which appears at the end of the document.

Because, as noted above, data on the defense establishment are not published, the data presented below on the representation of Arabs relate to the Government ministries system and the healthcare system.

## 2. Arab Employees in the Civil Service<sup>7</sup>

In 2019, the civil service employed a total of 80,198 employees in 96 units, of whom **9,763 (12.2%) were Arabs**. By contrast, in 2007, when the Government adopted a resolution to set a goal for the rate of Arabs in the civil service, they comprised 6.17% of the civil servants.<sup>8</sup> As mentioned above, Arabs comprise approximately 20% of Israel's population. In 2019, some 13% of the Arab employees (1,268 people) in the civil service were Druze, which exceeds their representation in the general Arab population (7.6%). The rate of Druze employees among all civil servants (1.6%) approximates the ratio of Druze in the total population.<sup>9</sup>

Among Arab civil servants, 57% are men and 43% are women. By contrast, women comprise 62% of all civil servants. We note in this context that, in general, Arab

**In 2019, there were 9,763 Arab employees in the civil service, comprising 12.2% of all employees**

**Among Arab civil servants, 57% are men and 43% are women, in contrast to the gender distribution of civil servants in general**

<sup>6</sup> Ibid., page 9.

<sup>7</sup> Ayat Rahal, Director of Partnerships and Employment Diversity Policy at the Civil Service Commission, response to an inquiry from the Knesset Research and Information Center, email, June 21<sup>st</sup> 2020 [Hebrew].

<sup>8</sup> Civil Service Commission, *Appropriate representation of the Arab population, including the Druze and Circassians, in the civil service, 2007 Report*, May 11<sup>th</sup> 2008 [Hebrew].

<sup>9</sup> Central Bureau of Statistics, *The Druze population in Israel—A collection of data for the Prophet Shuaib Holiday*, April 23<sup>rd</sup> 2020 [Hebrew].

women are employed at lower rates than both Jewish women and Arab men. In 2018, the employment rate of Arab women over age 15 was 29%, while the employment rate of Jewish women was 64%.<sup>10</sup>

**Two-thirds of Arab employees (66%) were employed in the healthcare system, and one-third (34%) in the Government ministries system.** This breakdown differs from that of civil servants in general, of whom 55% were employed in Government ministries and 45% in the healthcare system.

### **Arab Employees in the Government ministries system**

**In 2019, 43,873 employees were employed in the Government ministries system, of whom 3,360 (7.7%) were Arabs. Some 54% of Arab employees were employed in the various professional grades** (the social sciences and humanities grade stands out in this regard with 11% of the Arab employees) and 46% in the administrative grade. This breakdown is similar to that of all employees in the Government ministries system (57% in the professional grades and 43% in the administrative grade).<sup>11</sup>

Arabs comprised [10% or more of the employees](#) in six of the 31 professional grades in which civil servants were employed in the Government ministries system in 2019: inspectors in the Ministry of Education (two different grades: 17% and 18%),<sup>12</sup> teachers (15%), social workers (14%), nurses (13%) and public defenders (13%).

A breakdown of employees in the Government ministries system by [employment rank](#) (which is a measure of seniority in the system) shows **a higher rate of entry-level workers (i.e., those at the lowest level) among Arabs than among civil servants in general: 49% of the Arab employees in the Government ministries system are employed at the entry level, as compared to 39% of all employees. Correspondingly, the ratio of Arabs at more senior levels is smaller in relation to all employees, and the gaps increase with rank**—while 3.7% of all employees in the

Two-thirds of Arab employees were employed in 2019 in the healthcare system

In the Government system, 3,360 employees were Arabs, which is 7.7% of the employees in the system. 54% of Arab employees were employed in the professional grades, and 46% in the administrative grade

In the Government system, there is a higher rate of entry-level workers and a lower rate of senior level employees among Arabs than among civil servants in general. The gaps increase with rank

<sup>10</sup> Central Bureau of Statistics, *Statistical Abstract of Israel 2019—No. 70*, Labor Market, [Table 9.1, Persons aged 15 and over and persons aged 25–54 \(prime working-age group\), by civilian labour force characteristics, population group and sex](#), September 26<sup>th</sup> 2019.

<sup>12</sup> Ayat Rahal, Director of Policy and Cooperation, Employment Diversity Division at the Civil Service Commission, response to an inquiry by the Knesset Research and Information Center, email, June 21<sup>st</sup> 2020.

<sup>13</sup> Arabs comprise 18% of those employed at the grade in Appendix A-321, and 17% of those employed at the grade in Appendix E-325

Government ministries system hold senior ranks, only 1.5% of Arab employees do. Moreover, Arab employees constitute only 3.1% of all senior-level employees.<sup>13</sup> Meanwhile, the rate of students among Arab employees (8.5%) is similar to the ratio of students among all employees in the system (8.2%).

In a November 2019 discussion regarding increasing employment diversity in the civil service that took place in the Knesset Finance Committee, the Civil Service Commissioner referred to the challenge of filling senior civil service positions with members of the Arab population. He suggested that the reason for this phenomenon is the physical distance between the north of Israel—where a large part of the Arab population lives—and Jerusalem, the location of most Government ministries. According to him, the housing assistance that the State provides is not sufficient, and he noted that in this context, the Civil Service Commission is interested in **expanding flexible employment**.<sup>14</sup> In response to a request from the Knesset Research and Information Center, the Civil Service Commission stated in June 2020 that the flexible employment model was being examined.<sup>15</sup> The Director of Salary and Employment Agreements in the Ministry of Finance also addressed this subject, and the report on civil service salary expenditures for 2018 states in this context that remote work will increase the representation in the civil service of populations that have heretofore been excluded from the labor market—including minorities who live far from large employment centers and do not have access to public transportation.<sup>16</sup> We note that due to the COVID-19 crisis, the options for flexible employment in the civil service have been expanded, although at present these are temporary arrangements.

In 2019, the Civil Service Commissioner referred to the difficulty in filling senior positions with members of the Arab population due to the distance between their places of residence and the government offices in Jerusalem. Expanding flexible employment opportunities can help

<sup>13</sup> Without considering students. Employees are divided into four levels: entry-level, professional management, intermediate level, and senior management.

<sup>15</sup> 22nd Knesset, Finance Committee, Protocol 13, [Increasing diversity in employment in civil service, with the participation of the Civil Service Commissioner, Prof. Daniel Hershkowitz](#), November 5<sup>th</sup> 2019 [Hebrew].

<sup>16</sup> Ayat Rahal, Director of Partnerships and Employment Diversity Policy at the Civil Service Commission, response to an inquiry by the Knesset Research and Information Center, email, June 8<sup>th</sup> 2020 [Hebrew].

<sup>16</sup> Ministry of Finance, Salary and Employment Arrangements Division, [Accounting for wage expenditures in the civil service and security agencies for 2018](#), February 4<sup>th</sup> 2020 [Hebrew].



Arab employees in the civil service are entitled to a rent stipend of up to NIS 2,000 per month as well as reimbursement for travel expenses from their permanent place of residence to work and back, if the distance between their permanent place of residence and their place of work is greater than 70 km.

The *Diversifying the Civil Service* report published by the Civil Service Commission states that in 2018, there were 539 Arab employees (who constitute 5.8% of all Arab employees in civil service) who exercised their right for participation in their rent. However, we do not know how many of the Arab employees were eligible for such participation.<sup>17</sup> The Civil Service Commission estimates that the number of employees who exercised this right in 2019 remained unchanged.<sup>18</sup>

### **Employment of Arabs in the Various Ministries**

**The ratio of Arab employees out of all employees in 2019 exceeded 10% in only three of the 22 ministries:** the Ministry of Interior and the Ministry of Health—each having 18% of its employees from the Arab community—and the Ministry of Labor, Welfare and Social Services, where 12% of the employees were Arabs.<sup>19</sup>

### **Arab Employees in the Healthcare System**

**In 2019, the healthcare system had 36,324 employees, of whom 6,403 (or 18%) were Arabs. Some 85% of the Arab employees in the system were employed in the professional grades** (most notably the nursing grade, in which 43% of the Arab workers were employed, as compared to 37% of all employees in the healthcare system) and 15% in the administrative grades. Note that the rate of Arabs employed in the professional grades is higher than among all employees (77%).

**In 2019, the healthcare system had 6,403 Arab employees—18% of all the employees in the system—of whom 85% were employed in various professional grades**

In 2019, [Arabs comprised more than 20% of all employees](#) in six of the 21 professional grades in the healthcare system; in an additional six grades, they comprised more

<sup>17</sup> Civil Service Commission, Occupational Diversity Division, *Diversifying the civil service: diversity and representation report in the civil service for the year 5778–5779, 2019*, May 2020, p. 21 [Hebrew]; Civil Service Commission, Planning, Oversight and Work Conditions Department, [Regulation regarding the delegation of authorities to Government ministries regarding rent subsidies](#), November 22<sup>nd</sup> 2017 [Hebrew]; Civil Service Commission, *Civil Service Regulations, Clause 26.221* [Hebrew].

<sup>18</sup> Ayat Rahal, Director of Partnerships and Employment Diversity Policy at the Civil Service Commission, response to an inquiry from the Knesset Research and Information Center, email, June 8<sup>th</sup> 2020 [Hebrew].

<sup>20</sup> The reference here is to a Government entity headed by a minister, including all its subordinate auxiliary units. There are a total of 22 such entities, not including the Ministry of Defense.



than 10% of the employees. The most notable employment grades—i.e., those with the highest rates of Arab employees—were public health nurses (30% of those employed in this grade were Arabs), x-ray technicians (27%), and doctors (25%).

An examination of the [employment ranks](#) found a higher rate of entry-level employees—i.e., those at the lowest level—among Arabs (70%) than among civil servants in general (64%). The rate of senior and mid-level civil servants is lower among Arabs (0.2% and 5%) than among civil servants in general (0.7% and 10%, respectively).

### 3. Recruiting Arabs to the Civil Service

#### 3.1 Recruiting Arabs—Non Designated Tenders

In 2019, the Civil Service Commission issued 2,991 general public tenders, to which 132,717 applications were submitted. Of these applications, **11% were submitted by candidates from the Arab population. Some 12% of the people selected in these tenders were Arabs.**<sup>20</sup>

Arabs submitted 11% of the candidacies for general tenders in 2019.

Some 12% of the people selected in these tenders were Arabs

A previous document by the Knesset Research and Information Center presented data regarding the progress of Arab candidates (as well as candidates from other protected groups) through the screening stages of the recruitment process. According to the data for 2017 presented in the document, that year **63% of the applications submitted for public tenders (both regular and for senior positions) by Arab candidates met the minimum qualifications. This rate was similar to that for ultra-Orthodox candidates, higher than that for Ethiopian immigrants and of people with disabilities, and smaller than that for new immigrants.** Some 3.3% of the candidacies submitted by members of the Arab population and that met the minimum qualifications won their tender; this rate is higher only than that of ultra-Orthodox candidates and is similar to the average for all candidates.<sup>21</sup>

<sup>20</sup> Nihaya Diab, Senior Coordinator (Knowledge Management, Research and Surveys), Examinations and Tenders Division, Civil Service Commission, response to inquiry from the Knesset Research and Information Center, email, June 22<sup>nd</sup> 2020 [Hebrew]; idem, phone call June 24<sup>th</sup> 2020 [Hebrew].

<sup>21</sup> Michal Lehrer and Dr. Ayala Eliyahu, [Appropriate representation of different populations in the civil service: Data on Israel and a comparative perspective](#), Knesset Research and Information Center, August 5<sup>th</sup> 2018, pp. 15–16 [Hebrew]; for comparative purposes with the other protected groups, 51% of Ethiopian applicants met the minimum requirements as

For the purpose of this document, we asked the Civil Service Commission for updated data regarding the progress of Arab candidates (as well as candidates from the other protected groups) through the screening stages of the recruitment process, in order to see if the situation described above had changed.

The Civil Service Commission stated that due to limitations in its computer systems, this information could not be provided.<sup>22</sup> We may therefore raise the question of **how it is possible to identify obstacles to the recruitment to the civil service of members of this group (and other protected groups)—as well as the changes that occur in them over the years (including those resulting from the Commission's employment diversity policy)—without the full picture of their progress through the recruitment stages.**

### Senior Positions

In 2019, the Civil Service Commission issued 46 public tenders for senior positions (including in the security agencies), for which 1,095 applications were submitted. **Some 7% of the applications (82) were submitted by Arab candidates, and two of the 29 people selected in these tenders (7%) were Arabs.** In addition, Arab candidates submitted three of the 52 applications to search committees charged with staffing senior positions that year, none of whom was selected for the positions.<sup>23</sup>

Some 7% of the applications in public tenders for senior positions were submitted by Arab candidates. Two of the 29 selected in these tenders were Arabs

### 3.2 Recruiting Arabs—Designated Tenders

In 2019, 269 designated tenders were published for the Arab population (out of 449 tenders for protected groups).<sup>24</sup>

These tenders received a total of 5,757 applications. **The average number of applications per tender submitted by the Arab population (21) is much higher**

Some 60% of the designated tenders published in 2019 were intended for the Arab population, and an average of 21 candidates applied for each tender

---

did 77% of applicants who were new immigrants, 64% of ultra-Orthodox applicants, and 58% of applicants with disabilities.

<sup>22</sup> Nihaya Diab, Senior Coordinator (Knowledge Management, Research and Surveys), Examinations and Tenders Division, Civil Service Commission, response to inquiry from the Knesset Research and Information Center, phone call, June 22<sup>nd</sup> 2020 [Hebrew].

<sup>23</sup> Idem, response to a request from the Knesset Research and Information Center, email, June 22<sup>nd</sup> 2020 [Hebrew].

<sup>24</sup> Ibid.

than the average number of applications submitted for tenders for people with disabilities (11) or for Ethiopians (8), but it is lower than the average number of applications submitted for tenders designated for the ultra-Orthodox (34).<sup>25</sup>

According to the Civil Service Commission, [46% of the applications submitted for tenders designated for members of the Arab population met the minimum requirements](#). Compared to the other protected groups, this rate was higher only than that of ultra-Orthodox candidates (40%) but lower than that of Ethiopians (51%) and people with disabilities (52%), and even that of candidates in non-designated tenders (62%).<sup>26</sup>

Data from the Civil Service Commission show that through the date of retrieval, [the screening process resulted in the selection of candidates in only 38% of the tenders published in 2019 that were designated for Arabs](#). This figure is higher than the rate of tenders designated for people with disabilities or Ethiopians that ended in the selection of a candidate (34% and 30%, respectively), but lower than the rate of tenders designated for the ultra-Orthodox society (52%) and non-designated tenders (49%) that resulted in the selection of a candidate.<sup>27</sup>

#### 4. Representation of Arabs in Management Training Programs

The Civil Service Commission has runs several management training programs, including the Civil Service Cadet Program, the Senior Staff Reserves Program, and the Senior Staff Fellows Program. The inclusion of candidates from groups with diverse backgrounds into these programs may serve as a tool for advancing the representation and status of these groups in the civil service.

Some 46% of the applications submitted for tenders designated for members of the Arab population met the minimum requirements, a lower rate than of most protected groups and even the rate for non-designated tenders

In only 38% of the tenders designated for the Arab population was a candidate selected at the end of the screening process. Note that no candidate was selected in most of the other tenders published in 2019

<sup>25</sup> Ibid.

<sup>26</sup> Nihaya Diab, Senior Coordinator (Knowledge Management, Research and Surveys), Examinations and Tenders Division, Civil Service Commission, response to inquiry from the Knesset Research and Information Center, phone call, June 24<sup>th</sup> 2020 [Hebrew]; Civil Service Commission, Occupational Diversity Division, [Diversifying the civil service: Diversity and representation report in the civil service for the year 5778–5779, 2019](#), May 2020, p. 40 [Hebrew].

<sup>27</sup> Nihaya Diab, Senior Coordinator (Knowledge Management, Research and Surveys), Examinations and Tenders Division, Civil Service Commission, response to inquiry from the Knesset Research and Information Center, phone call, June 24<sup>th</sup> 2020 [Hebrew]; Civil Service Commission, Occupational Diversity Division, [Diversifying the civil service: Diversity and representation report in the civil service for the year 5778–5779, 2019](#), May 2020, p. 40 [Hebrew]; Nihaya Diab, Senior Coordinator (Knowledge Management, Research and Surveys), Examinations and Tenders Division, Civil Service Commission, response to inquiry from the Knesset Research and Information Center, email, June 22<sup>nd</sup> 2020 [Hebrew].

<sup>28</sup> Civil Service Commission, Occupational Diversity Division, [Diversifying the civil service: Diversity and representation report in the civil service for the year 5778–5779, 2019](#), May 2020, pp. 43–47 [Hebrew].

**The Civil Service Cadet Program** is designed to recruit candidates and prepare them to hold management positions in civil service units in the future. The program has been running since 2012, and 194 cadets have participated through 2018. Data from the Civil Service Commission show that **Arabs comprised 5.4% of the candidates for the program from 2015–2019. Ten Arab cadets (5%) participated in the program from its launch through 2018.** Cohort V (2016) had four Arab cadets (out of 28 cadets total in the cohort), but the two subsequent cohorts—2017 and 2018—had only one Arab cadet each.

**The Senior Staff Reserves Program** trains mid-level managers in the civil service and is intended for employees who already serve at this level. To date, 279 managers have been accepted into the program, and 159 have completed it. **Program graduates include 15 Arab employees, 9.4% of all graduates.** We note that Arabs comprise 6.6% of all the mid-level civil servants; in other words, **the Arab population has a higher representation among program graduates than among the program's target population.**

**The Senior Staff Fellows Program** is intended for senior managers in the civil service. To date, the program has accepted 191 managers (of whom 142 have already completed it and 49 have not yet done so), **of whom 12 fellows (6.3%) are Arab.** In this case, too, **Arab employees are more highly represented in the program than among the employees at the relevant level** (as Arabs comprise 3.3% of the senior-level employees in the civil service).

Ten Arab cadets participated in the Civil Service Cadet program through 2018, 5% of all

Arabs are more highly represented in the Senior Staff Reserves Program and the Senior Staff Fellows Program than within the target populations of these programs—mid- and senior-level employees in the civil service.

## Tables and Charts

**Table 1: Grades in which the greatest percentage of the Arab employees in the Government ministries system were employed, 2019<sup>29</sup>**

Employment Grade	Administrative	Academics in Social Sciences and Humanities	Students	Law	Social Workers
Percentage of all Arab employees in the employment grade	46%	11%	8.5%	7%	6%

**Table 2: Professional grades in the Government ministries system in which Arabs comprise more than 10% of employees, 2019<sup>30</sup>**

Employment Grade	Inspectors in the Ministry of Education (Appendix A-321)	Inspectors in the Ministry of Education (Appendix E-325)	Teachers	Social Workers	Nurses	Public Defenders
Percentage of all employees who are Arab	18%	17%	15%	14%	13%	13%

**Table 3: Breakdown of Arab employees and all employees at various levels in the Government ministries system, 2019<sup>31</sup>**

Employment Level	Entry-level	Professional Management	Mid-level	Senior Level
Arab Employees	49%	34%	15%	1.5%
All Employees	38%	38%	20%	3.7%

<sup>29</sup> Ayat Rahal, Director of Partnerships and Employment Diversity Policy at the Civil Service Commission, response to inquiry from the Knesset Research and Information Center, email, June 21<sup>st</sup> 2020 [Hebrew].

<sup>30</sup> Ibid.

<sup>31</sup> Ibid. Not including students. The figures do not total 100% due to rounding.

**Table 4: Grades in which the greatest percentage of the Arab employees in the healthcare system were employed, 2019<sup>32</sup>**

	Nurses	Doctors	Managerial	Public Health Nurses
Percentage of all Arab Employees in the Employment Grade	43%	22%	11%	7%

**Table 5: Professional grades in the healthcare system in which Arabs comprise more than 20% of employees, 2019<sup>33</sup>**

	Public Health Nurses	X-ray Technicians	Doctors	Pharmacists	Physical Therapists	Nurses
Percentage of all employees who are Arab	30%	27%	25%	24%	22%	20%

**Table 6: Breakdown of Arab employees and all employees by employment levels in the healthcare system<sup>34</sup>**

Employment Level	Entry-level	Professional Management	Mid-level	Senior Level
Arab Employees	70%	24%	5%	0.2%
All Employees	64%	24%	10%	0.7%

<sup>32</sup> Ibid. In each of the other grades, the rate is less than 3%.

<sup>33</sup> Ayat Rahal, Director of Partnerships and Employment Diversity Policy at the Civil Service Commission, response to inquiry from the Knesset Research and Information Center, email, June 21<sup>st</sup> 2020 [Hebrew].

<sup>34</sup> The figures do not total 100% due to rounding. In both populations, an additional 1% are students

**Table 7: Rate of Arab employees in Government ministries, and an indication of whether they met the governmental goal for the employment of the Arab population, 2019<sup>35</sup>**

Ministry	Ratio of Arabs	Goal	Ministry	Ratio of Arabs	Goal
Transport	6.3%	✗	Interior	18.4%	✓
Environmental Protection	6%	✗	Health	17.6%	✓
Construction and Housing	6%	✗	Labor, Social Affairs and Social Services	11.9%	✓
Tourism	5.3%	✗	Education	8.2%	✗
Communications	5%	✗	Development of the Negev and Galilee	8.2%	✗
Energy	4.9%	✗	Public Security	7.6%	✗
Economy	4%	✗	Science and Technology	7.5%	✗
Prime Minister's Office	3%	✗	Agriculture and Rural Development	7.4%	✗
Foreign Affairs	2.7%	✗	Social Equality	7%	✗
Aliyah and Integration	1.4%	✗	Justice	6.9%	✗
Religious Services	0%	✗	Finance	6.4%	✗

**Table 8: Average number of applications for tenders designated for each protected group, 2019<sup>36</sup>**

	Ultra-Orthodox	Arabs	People With Disabilities	Ethiopian Immigrants
Average number of applications	34	21	11	8

<sup>35</sup> The reference here is to a Government entity headed by a minister, including all its subordinate auxiliary units. There are a total of 22 such entities, not including the Ministry of Defense.

<sup>36</sup> Nihaya Diab, Senior Coordinator (Knowledge Management, Research and Surveys), Examinations and Tenders Division, Civil Service Commission, response to inquiry from the Knesset Research and Information Center, email, June 22<sup>nd</sup> 2020 [Hebrew].



**Table 9: Rate of candidates meeting minimum qualifications for designated and general tenders, 2019<sup>37</sup>**

	Orthodox Society	Arab Society	Ethiopian Immigrants	People With Disabilities	General Population <sup>38</sup>
Rate of applications that met minimum requirements	40%	46%	51%	52%	62%

**Table 10: Rate of tenders designated for protected groups and non-designated tenders that concluded with the selection of a candidate, 2019<sup>39</sup>**

	Orthodox Society	Arab Society	Ethiopian Immigrants	People With Disabilities	Non-Designated Tenders
Ratio of Tenders Finalized by Candidate Selection	52%	38%	34%	30%	49%

<sup>37</sup> Idem, phone call, June 24<sup>th</sup> 2020.

<sup>38</sup> Rate of applicants who met the minimum qualifications for non-designated tenders during that same year.

<sup>39</sup> Nihaya Diab, Senior Coordinator (Knowledge Management, Research, and Surveys), Examinations and Tenders Division, Civil Service Commission, response to inquiry from the Knesset Research and Information Center, phone call, June 22<sup>nd</sup> 2020 [Hebrew]; Civil Service Commission, Occupational Diversity Division, [Diversifying the civil service: Diversity and representation report in the civil service for the year 5778–5779, 2019](#), May 2020, p. 40 [Hebrew].